Integrating Biopsychosocial Determinants of Health to Develop and Implement Culturally-Sensitive Care for Women: An Example of “Harmony” Research with African American Women

Cheryl L. Woods-Giscombe, PhD PMHNP, FAAN, FABMR
LeVine Distinguished Professor of Quality of Life, Health Promotion & Wellness Social & Health Psychologist – Psychiatric Nurse Practitioner
“Of all the forms of inequality, injustice in health is the most shocking and inhumane.”
– Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., 1966
“Of all the forms of inequality, injustice in health is the most shocking and inhuman.” – Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., 1966

“Without mental health there can be no true physical health” -- Dr Brock Chisholm, first Director-General of the World Health Organization (WHO, 1954)
Women and Chronic Health Conditions
Women and Chronic Health Conditions

One of the major social determinants of health is psychological stress.
According to the US Department of Health and Human Services, women of color, and African American women in particular, experience disproportionately high rates of morbidity and mortality related to various health conditions.

- Cardiovascular disease
- Obesity
- Lupus
- Diabetes
- Cancer
- Uterine Fibroids
- Adverse birth outcomes
- Mental illness morbidity
- Mental health service utilization
Mental Health Disparities in the US

• Annually, approximately 18% of US adults have a diagnosable mental disorder – about 4% of adults have a serious mental illness.

• Mental and behavioral disorders, in the US, are among the leading causes of disability accounting for 13.6% of all years of life lost to disability and premature death.

• Although rates of depression are lower in African American/Blacks (24.6%) and Hispanics (19.6%) than in whites (34.7%) - minority groups are more likely to experience risk factors that can cause mental health disorders and illness is more likely to be persistent.

• People from racial/ethnic minority groups are less likely to receive mental health care.
  • Social mechanisms contributing to mental health services access and utilization disparities for diverse racial/ethnic groups include:
    • Stigma about mental health issues
    • Lack of insurance/financial and logistical barriers
    • Racism, provider bias/cultural microaggressions
    • Language barriers
    • Lack of workforce diversity
    • Geographic access barriers
    • MH system weighted towards White values/norms

Inaccessibility of High-Quality Mental Health Services

• According to the surgeon general, “despite the existence of effective treatments, disparities lie in the availability, accessibility and quality of mental health services for racial and ethnic minorities.”

• A recent report by the Kaiser Family Foundation indicates that less than 50% of the mental health care needs of residents of most states have been met due to mental health care professional shortages.

• Given, mental and behavioral health is a critical and frequently un-/under-addressed need in racial/ethnic minority communities, closing the gap in care, even in HPSA regions, requires increased collaboration to prioritize adequate provision of culturally and linguistically appropriate services.

“The federal government has a critical role to play in addressing the issue of racial and ethnic disparities in mental health status and mental health care.”
~ American Psychological Association

According to the American Psychological Association’s Workforce Studies, the US psychology workforce is not as diverse as the general population – in 2015, 86% of psychologists were white, 5% were Asian, 5% percent were Hispanic, and 4% percent were Black/African-American.

Psychologists frequently or very frequently provided services to White/Caucasian (96 percent), heterosexual (96 percent), and adult (83 percent) populations.

Crucial advances have been made in our knowledge of the social determinants of health and health behaviors. Existing research on health disparities, however, generally fails to address a known paradox in the literature: While blacks have higher risk of medical morbidity relative to non-Hispanic whites, blacks have lower rates of common stress-related forms of psychopathology such as major depression and anxiety disorders. The Environmental Affordances Model is an integrative framework for research to address the origins of both physical and mental health disparities that considers self-regulatory health behaviors and stress coping... Transdisciplinary approaches, such as the EAM are needed to understand the origins of group-based disparities to
**Working Group Members:**

Elizabeth Brondolo, PhD, Chair Kahaema Byer, MS
Peter J. Gianaros, PhD
Cindy Liu, PhD
Aric A. Prather, PhD
Kamala Thomas, PhD
Cheryl L. Woods-Giscombé, PhD

**APA Staff**

Lula A. Beatty, PhD
  - Senior Director, Health Disparities
Patricia DiSandro
  - Program Coordinator, Health Disparities
Gwendolyn Puryear Keita, PhD Executive Director (2006–2016), Public Interest Directorate

**APA CEO**

Norman Anderson, PhD
Women and Chronic Health Conditions

Stress-related disparities in chronic illness
- overweight
- obesity
- chronic illness
Women of Color and Health Disparities

STRESS

Stress-related disparities (African American Women)
- 80% are overweight
- 50% are obese
- 25% > 55 have diabetes
1. **Nervous system.** The heart may beat faster, and blood pressure rises to ready the body to fight the perceived threat.

2. **Musculoskeletal system.** Muscles tense and can trigger tension headaches.

3. **Respiratory system.** Breathing quickens.

4. **Cardiovascular system.** Heart rate increases.

5. **Endocrine system.** Signals sent from glands to the body cause a release of cortisol into the body to fight the perceived threat.

6. **Gastrointestinal system.** Eating habits may change, and the feeling of “butterflies” in your stomach may occur.

[https://brewminate.com/stress-types-symptoms-sources-and-how-to-reduce-it/]
Figure 9.10 Roles of the hypothalamus, adrenal medulla, and adrenal cortex in the stress response.

**Short term**
- Hypothalamus
  - Nerve impulses
  - Spinal cord
  - Preganglionic sympathetic fibers
  - Adrenal medulla
  - Catecholamines (epinephrine and norepinephrine)

**Short-term stress response**
1. Increased heart rate
2. Increased blood pressure
3. Liver converts glycogen to glucose and releases glucose to blood
4. Dilation of bronchioles
5. Changes in blood flow patterns, leading to increased alertness and decreased digestive and kidney activity
6. Increased metabolic rate

**More prolonged**
- Corticotrophic cells of anterior pituitary
  - ACTH
  - Adrenal cortex
  - Mineralocorticoids
  - Glucocorticoids

**Long-term stress response**
1. Retention of sodium and water by kidneys
2. Increased blood volume and blood pressure
3. Suppression of immune system
4. Proteins and fats converted to glucose or broken down for energy
5. Increased blood sugar
THE STRESS RESPONSE

ENVIRONMENT

PERCEPTION
OF THREAT

HYPOTHALAMUS (brain)
PITUITARY (endocrine)

STRESSORS
(from sensory input)

SHORT-TERM EFFECTS: HYPOTHALAMUS–PITUITARY–ADRENAL CORTEX (HYPAC)
Cortisol, corticoids, etc.
- Fluid loss
- Glucose by gluconeogenesis
- Inflammation
- Brain norepinephrine

SHORT-TERM EFFECTS: SYMPATHETIC–ADRENAL MEDULLA (SAM)
Epinephrine, norepinephrine, etc.
- Heart rate
- Respiration
- Plasma FFAs and sugar
- Triglycerides
- Platelet aggregation
- Kidney clearance
- Blood to skeletal muscles
- Muscular tension

LONG-TERM (CHRONIC) EFFECTS
Immune system compromise
Atherosclerosis
Depression
Insulin insensitivity
Obesity
High blood pressure
Protein breakdown
- Blood
- Bone (osteoporosis)
- Muscle (heart, too)
- Immunoglobulin

LONG-TERM (CHRONIC) EFFECTS
Essential hypertension
Heart disease/attack
Stroke
Atherosclerosis
Diabetes
Cancer
Ulcers
Chronic GI problems
Allergies/eczema
Autoimmune diseases
Arthritis
Headaches
Reduced immunity
Kidney and liver disease

• Fluid loss
• Glucose by gluconeogenesis
• Inflammation
• Brain norepinephrine

• Heart rate
• Respiration
• Plasma FFAs and sugar
• Triglycerides
• Platelet aggregation
• Kidney clearance
• Blood to skeletal muscles
• Muscular tension

• Essential hypertension
• Heart disease/attack
• Stroke
• Atherosclerosis
• Diabetes
• Cancer
• Ulcers
• Chronic GI problems
• Allergies/eczema
• Autoimmune diseases
• Arthritis
• Headaches
• Reduced immunity
• Kidney and liver disease

• Immune system compromise
• Atherosclerosis
• Depression
• Insulin insensitivity
• Obesity
• High blood pressure
• Protein breakdown
• Blood
• Bone (osteoporosis)
• Muscle (heart, too)
• Immunoglobulin

• Essential hypertension
• Heart disease/attack
• Stroke
• Atherosclerosis
• Diabetes
• Cancer
• Ulcers
• Chronic GI problems
• Allergies/eczema
• Autoimmune diseases
• Arthritis
• Headaches
• Reduced immunity
• Kidney and liver disease
In order to *effectively* study and understand the influence of stress on health in women, we must use culturally- and gender-relevant definitions and operationalizations of stress. 

Race and Gender Matter: A Multidimensional Approach to Conceptualizing and Measuring Stress in African American Women

Cheryl L. Woods-Giscombé and
The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Marcia Lobel
Stony Brook University

Abstract

Based on prior research and theory, the authors constructed a multidimensional model of stress in African American women comprised of race-related, gender-related, and generic stress. Exposure to and appraisal of these three types of stress were combined into a higher-order global stress factor. Using structural equation modeling, the fit of this stress factor and its ability to predict distress symptoms were examined in 189 socioeconomically diverse African American women aged 21 to 78. Results support the multidimensional conceptualization and operationalization of stress. Race-related, gender-related, and generic stress contributed equally to the global stress factor, and global stress predicted a significant amount of variance in distress symptoms and intensity. This model
interactions...individuals form ideas and develop expectations about other people and relationships, and the world at large

(vs. rejection or hostility); and schemas about the world that reflect experiences of safety (vs. threat) and fair treatment (vs. injustice; Baldwin, 1992; Beck, 1987; Miranda, Andersen, & Edwards, 2013). Racial or ethnic stereotypes can be considered schemas about the characteristics associated with membership in a racial or ethnic group (Maris, Claes, Van Damme, & Hoorens, 2016).

There are clear SES differences in the types of schemas individuals develop. For example, low SES has been associated with a range of negative schemas about the self, including low self-esteem (Twenge & Campbell, 2002) and reduced perceptions of personal control and autonomy (Haushofer, 2013; Kraus et al., 2012). Lower SES is also associated with negative schemas about others, including less trust and higher levels of hostile attributions about other people's intentions that life is meaningful (Evans, 2009; Smyth, 2014; Haushofer, 2013).

Data on race differences in schemas about the self, others, and the world at large are more limited, and the findings highlight the ways in which influences from the larger social context shape individual-level schemas. For example, meta-analyses indicate that Black individuals have higher levels of overall self-esteem in comparison to White individuals, whereas Hispanic and Asian individuals have lower levels of self-esteem. However, the Black advantage in self-esteem did not emerge until the 1980s, after a period of tremendous social change and increase in civil rights (Twenge & Campbell, 2002).

The development of negative schemas is likely to be a function, at least in part, of the specific stressors that more commonly face low-SES individuals and members of racial and ethnic minority groups (M. B. Spencer, 2006). The effects begin early in the lifespan, as children develop schemas reflecting the contexts in which they develop. For example, childhood maltreatment can generate negative self-schemas reflecting themes of worthlessness and unacceptability. These early stressors may also generate negative schemas about other people, reflecting experiences and expectations of interpersonal harshness (Halvorsen, Wang, Eiseman, & Waterloo, 2010; Lumley & Harkness, 2007). Witnessing violence appears to generate anticipation of social constraint, schemas reflecting the notion that others will not validate or support one's perceptions or feelings.
Women of Color and Health Disparities

- Sociocultural and historical phenomenon
- Strength obligation
- Emotional suppression
- Resistance of support or vulnerability
- Motivation to succeed despite limited resources
- Disproportionate caregiving
- Assets: Survival – self and community
- Limitations: Neglected self-care
- May exacerbate stress and stress-related disparities
Superwoman Schema  (Woods-Giscombe, 2010):

Related Concepts

Network Stress
(See Dohrenwend, 1977; Kessler & McLeod, 1984; Lobel et al., 2000; Thoits, 1991; Woods- Giscombe et al., 2015)
Stages of the Stress Response

General Adaptation Syndrome of Hans Selye (1907-1982)

- **Alarm**—when one feels threatened
  - Activation of the fight or flight reaction
- **Resistance**—mobilization of resources to solve the problem
  - Continued stress causes adaptation
- **Exhaustion**
  - Adaptation fails and level of function decreases
Preliminary evidence supports components of the model (e.g., Woods-Giscombé & Lobel, 2008; Woods-Giscombé, 2010; Woods-Giscombé, Lobel, & Zimmer, under review)

A **program of research** is needed to confirm the model and inform future culturally-relevant, community-based interventions to ameliorate cardiometabolic health disparities.
Superwoman Schema Conceptual Framework

Woods-Giscombe, 2010

Antecedents to Motivations (proximal and distal) → Intrapeersonal Motivations → SWS Characteristics (attitudes, beliefs) → Manifestations (overt and covert behaviors) → Health Outcomes (psychological, physical)
The Giscombe Superwoman Schema Questionnaire: Psychometric Properties and Associations with Mental Health and Health Behaviors in African American Women

Cheryl L. Woods-Giscombe, PhD, Amani M. Allen, PhD, Angela R. Black, PhD, Teneka C. Steed, PhD, Yin Li, PhD & Charity Lackey

Published online: 13 May 2019

Download citation  https://doi.org/10.1080/01612840.2019.1534654

Abstract

The purpose of this research was to examine the psychometric properties of the Giscombe Superwoman Schema Questionnaire. Three separate studies conducted with 739 African American women provided preliminary evidence that the Questionnaire's factor structure aligns with the Superwoman Schema Conceptual Framework and has good reliability. In addition, it is positively...
Superwoman Schema - Sample Items

- Obligation to suppress emotions
  - “My tears are a sign of weakness”

- Obligation to help others
  - “I feel obligated to take care of others”

- Intense motivation to succeed
  - “No matter how hard I work, I feel like I should do more”

- Resistance to being vulnerable
  - “It’s hard for me to accept help from others”

- Obligation to help others
  - “I neglect the things that bring me joy”

**Should not be used or reproduced without permission from Dr. Cheryl Woods-Giscombe**
Study 3: Giscombe Superwoman Schema Questionnaire

Associations among SWS and:

- Depressive Symptoms (CESD)
- Perceived Stress (PSS)
- Sleep Quality (PSQI)
- Stress-Related Eating (UFC)
- Physical Inactivity (M-IPAQ)
Research Incorporating the Superwoman Schema Questionnaire

- Systemic Lupus Erythematosus (Lewis – Emory University)
- Systemic Lupus Erythematosus (Chae/Varner – Tulane University)
- Cardiometabolic Risk (Allen – Berkeley University)
- Telomere Activity (Allen et al. – Berkeley University/San Francisco State)
- Perinatal Anxiety and Depression (Sheffield – UNC Chapel Hill)
- Heart Rate Variability (Bronlow – The Ohio State University)
- Depressive Symptoms (Nelson – Brown University)
- African American Women’s Health Engagement (Packenham – NIEHS)
- African American Women College Students (Wade – NC A&T State Univ.)
- African American Women College Students (Watson-Singleton – Spelman)
- Resilience and Cardiometabolic Health in AAW (Williams – Ohio State)
Racial discrimination, the superwoman schema, and allostatic load: exploring an integrative stress-coping model among African American women

Amani M. Allen,1 Yijie Wang,2 David H. Chae,3 Melisa M. Price,4 Wizdom Powell,5 Teneka Steed,6 Angela Black,7 Firdaus S. Dhabhar,8 Leticia Marquez-Magaña,9 and Cheryl L. Woods-Giscombe10

1Divisions of Community Health Sciences and Epidemiology, University of California Berkeley School of Public Health, Berkeley, California. 2Department of Human Development and Family Studies, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan. 3Department of Human Development and Family Studies, College of Human Sciences, Auburn University, Auburn, Alabama. 4Phil R. Lee Institute for Health Policy Studies, University of California, San Francisco, California. 5Department of Psychiatry and Health Disparities Institute, UConn Health, Farmington, Connecticut. 6University of North Carolina, Greensboro, North Carolina. 7Department of Family Medicine and Community Health, University of Wisconsin-Madison, Madison, Wisconsin. 8Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences, Sylvester Comprehensive Cancer Center, Miller School of Medicine, University of Miami, Miami, Florida. 9Department of Cell and Molecular Biology, San Francisco State University, San Francisco, California. 10University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, School of Nursing, Chapel Hill, North Carolina

Address for correspondence: Amani M. Allen, Divisions of Community Health Sciences and Epidemiology, University of California Berkeley School of Public Health, 2121 Berkeley Way #5302, Berkeley, CA 94720–7360. amanialllen@berkeley.edu

Racial discrimination has been linked to allostatic load among African American women. Coping is a central component of the stress response process. However, limited attention has been given to the role of coping in studies examining racial discrimination as a social determinant of health. We examined whether the superwoman schema (SWS), a multidimensional culture-specific form of coping, modifies the association between racial discrimination and mental health among African American women.
Mindfulness-Based Stress Management Interventions to Reduce Chronic Condition Risk in African American Women

Community-Engaged and Multidisciplinary/Multi-Method Funding Support (Development and Execution):

1. NIH R01 (NIMHD) ~ $3.1 million (HARMONY Study)
2. Macy Faculty Scholars Program (2015-2017)/Thorpe Faculty Engaged Scholars Program (2014-2016)
3. Josiah Charles Trent Memorial Foundation Endowment Fund (Duke University; PI: Wilson, 2016)
5. TraCs 2K Grant (Cultural Relevance of Mindfulness for African Americans, 2013)
6. NCCAM 1R21 AT004276-01 (4-year feasibility RCT – 2009-2013)
7. Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration at the American Nurses Association Minority Fellowship Program (SAMHSA-MFP; 2007-2009)
8. UNC Center on Innovation in Health Disparity Research (CIHDR; NINR/NCMHD Grant P20NR8369, 2006-2008)
9. NINR T32NR007091 (UNC School of Nursing, 2005-2007)
11. W.B. Burghardt Dissertation Fellowship (Stony Brook University, 2004-2005)
HARMONY RCT: Conceptual Framework

Figure 1. Conceptual Framework - Proposed Targets of the NEEW and HARMONY Interventions

Attention Control Group – Nutrition and Exercise Education Workgroup (NEEW)
• Culturally-relevant exercise/nutrition education
• Motivational support

Experimental Group – HARMONY
• Culturally-relevant exercise/nutrition education
• Motivational support
• PLUS Culturally-relevant mindfulness training to address Superwoman Schema, Network and Contextualized Stress

Aim 1a: Primary Outcomes
• Increased Exercise for CM risk reduction
• Improved Dietary Intake for CM risk Reduction

Aim 1b: Secondary Outcomes
• Improved CM risk biomarkers:
  • BMI
  • % Body Fat
  • WHR
  • Blood Pressure
  • AIC
  • Inflammatory Markers (CRP, WHR)

Aim 2: Intermediate Outcomes
• Improvements in management of general, network, and contextualized stress through mindfulness, positive reappraisal *
• Improved mindful eating and self-care
• Improved self-regulation and resilience
• Improved exercise and diet self-efficacy

*Proposed direct impact on secondary outcomes
Study Characteristics/Components

- COVID web-based adapted, biobehavioral
- 8 intervention cohorts
- 12-month intervention
- 0, 4, 8, 12-month assessments
- Self-report measures
  - Stress
  - Mindfulness
  - Positive Reappraisal
  - Self-Regulation
  - Self-Efficacy
- Objective measures
  - Actigraphy,
  - FitBit® - Fitbase Technology,
  - Veggie Meter,
  - Inflammatory markers (CRP, IL-6
  - A1C
  - Body composition
- Readiness for change assessment
- Motivational support/buddy system
- NIH Behavior Change Consortium model of treatment fidelity (Training, Delivery, Receipt of Treatment, Enactment of Skills)
- Plan for ancillary biomarker and qualitative studies.
Women and Chronic Health Conditions

Summary:

1. Disproportionately high rates of chronic conditions in women continue to be shocking and inhuman(e).
2. Contextual and biopsychosocial process influence these conditions and require attention to understand, prevent, and ameliorate these conditions in women.
3. Biopsychosocial and psycho-neuroimmune and psychoneuroendocrine stress-related processes are somewhat known, but under-investigated, mechanisms influencing chronic conditions in women.
4. Culturally-sensitive and gender-specific care will integrate these complex, multidimensional factors that influence both physical and mental health.
5. Biopsychosocial conditions require biopsychosocial solutions for health and well-being among women.
Gratitude for Research Funding Sources
Gratitude for Research Educational Institutions
THANK YOU!